Introduction

- Jesney (2011a): Positional Licensing (PL; e.g. Waller 2011) is more powerful in Harmonic Grammar (HG) than in OT.
- Only in HG can PL produce licensing in multiple contexts.
- Tamil (Rasamany 2010; Chidambaram 1988): coronals appear in onsets and initial-syllable codas (1). Elsewhere they assimilate (2).

(1) 
µaa.b/ 'sorrow' 
µaa.g/ 'children'
µaa.b/ 'friend'
µaa.x/ a month

- Jesney shows that a PL analysis of these facts is possible only in HG.
- In OT, multiple licensing contexts require Positional Faithfulness (Beckman 1999).
- Jesney: PL may entirely replace PF in HG.

We give 2 arguments that PF is still necessary in HG.

Coronal Codas Assimilate outside \( \sigma_1 \) (2): non-coronals assimilate in all codas:

\( /\text{maa}\text{a} + \text{tun}/ \rightarrow \text{maa}\text{a}\text{x}\text{tun}/ \) 'tree (emph.)'
\( /\text{maa}\text{a} + \text{tun}/ \rightarrow \text{maa}\text{a}\text{x}\text{tun}/ \) 'an implement for dredging ponds'
\( /\text{maa}\text{a} + \text{kak}/ \rightarrow \text{maa}\text{a}\text{x}\text{kak}/ \) 'trees'

- This requires \( w(\text{LICENSE(place, Onset)}) > w(\text{IDENT(Place)}) \), but doesn’t determine directionally:

We give 2 arguments that PF is still necessary in HG.

1. PL triggers assimilation, but does not dictate directionality.
2. The PL analysis for coronals in Tamil is incompatible with non-coronals.

We've replicated Beckman’s PF analysis in the essentials.

Conclusion

- PL cannot fully replace PF in HG.
- As in OT, PL triggers feature sharing but cannot dictate the direction of assimilation.
- If the relevant generalization for this part of a phenomenon is positional, we still need PF.
- Admitting both positional licensing and positional faithfulness leads to some redundancy, but this situation seems unavoidable in both HG and OT.
- HG has advantages over OT, but this is not one of them.

Positional Faithfulness is as necessary in HG as it is in OT.

References


Acknowledgements

Thank you to Shannon Barrios, Abby Kaplan, Ed Rubin, and members of the UU Speech Acquisition Lab for many helpful comments and questions.